

THE ARIZONA DIVIDE

Goals: To analyze local Flagstaff patterns of segregation within the context of Plessy v. Ferguson, Mendez v. Westminster, and Brown v. Board of Education

Objectives: Students will analyze local school segregation practices and describe the impact on the local population through oral histories, culminating in a final research paper.

Grade level: 8 – 12

Materials:

Timeline paper, markers, colored pencils
Compare/Contrast chart
Computer lab
Audio headphones (to listen to oral histories)
Questions Worksheet

Procedures:

Introduce the lesson to the class, explaining the history and controversy of the civil rights movement. Discuss ways in which people were segregated (neighborhoods, schools, swimming pools, etc.) Incorporate Plessy v. Ferguson into this discussion. Was separate really equal?

Key terms to add into the discussion: de facto segregation, de jure segregation

Additional information:

The Mendez case represented the first successful challenge to the decades-old "separate but equal" doctrine in public school education and established an important legal precedent. In 1948, a federal court in Texas ruled that segregated schools for Mexican Americans were unconstitutional; in 1950, a federal court in Arizona followed suit. Meanwhile, Governor Warren would go on to become the Chief Justice of the United States Supreme Court and write the opinion in Brown v. Board of Education. Information from:

<http://www.teachersdomain.org/6-8/soc/ush/civil/mendez/index.html>

Activity 1:

Mix the order of these cases and leave off the date when given to the students. Allow them to research on-line and in textbooks to find the dates for each case.

Create a timeline of key court cases with a 1 paragraph explanation of each case and its consequence.

Art extension: Encourage colorful and illustrated timelines, decorating their project with cultural emblems and/or other images related to court cases.

1896 Plessy v. Ferguson “separate but equal”

1946 Mendez v. Westminster

1954 Brown v. Board of Education Topeka

1955 Brown v. Board of Education Topeka II “with all deliberate speed.”

1966 U.S. v. Jefferson County Board of Education

1968 Green v. County School Board

1969 Alexander v. Holmes (Mississippi) Board of Education

Focus:

Compare and contrast the premise and impact of Mendez v. Westminster and Brown v. Board of Education Topeka using a compare/contrast chart.

Activity 2:

Website searches in the computer lab: Give students a list of the following on-line sources to help with their research.

1. Read/Listen to the following oral histories from Cline Library [Colorado Plateau Digital Archives](#).
2. Take notes on their experiences, particularly dealing with school segregation, and the creation of South Beaver and Dunbar schools.
3. Compare and contrast the different perspectives of Mexican-American interviewees and Anglo interviewees.

Oral Histories for Los Recuerdos:

Benjamin Aginiga

http://www2.nau.edu/~libei-p/scadb/recdisplay.cfm?control_num=11712

http://www2.nau.edu/~libei-p/scadb/recdisplay.cfm?control_num=12126

Angie Barela and Polly Holmes

http://www2.nau.edu/~libei-p/scadb/recdisplay.cfm?control_num=11783

Felicitas Bobadilla Diaz

http://www2.nau.edu/~libei-p/scadb/recdisplay.cfm?control_num=11789

Wilfred F. Killip

http://www2.nau.edu/~libei-p/scadb/recdisplay.cfm?control_num=12737

Durward and Goldie McKinney

http://www2.nau.edu/~libei-p/scadb/recdisplay.cfm?control_num=12701

John and Lola Allen

http://www2.nau.edu/~libei-p/scadb/reclisplay.cfm?control_num=12717

Additional keyword search terms on the [Colorado Plateau Digital Archives](#):

- South Beaver School
- Emerson School
- Dunbar School
- Los Chantes
- Los Recuerdos del Barrio en Flagstaff

Activity 3:

Use the following website research worksheet to answer the following questions. Students may work in cooperative or jigsaw groups. Conduct research using [Colorado Plateau Digital Archives](#) and internet web sites related to the court cases (given in teacher resources below).

Class groups - Assign each group a set of questions. Each student should have a specific role (see below). After groups have answered the questions for their topics they should present their responses to the class.

Group Roles:

Computer operator(s)

Presenter (s)

Recorder (s)

Jigsaw groups - Use the same groups as above, but divide up the questions among group members. After researching and answering the questions, they should share their answers with the rest of the group

Web search questions:

1. How did Mendez v. Westminster “pave the way” for Brown?
2. What impact did Mendez v. Westminster have on Flagstaff schools?
3. When was Brown v. Board enacted?
4. Did the Flagstaff schools follow the rulings?
5. What different ethnic groups were living in Flagstaff?
6. How were these groups divided (ethnicity? neighborhoods? grade levels?)
7. How were the individuals affected by segregation in Flagstaff?
8. What schools were available in Flagstaff?

9. Who was sent to each school?
10. What happened once students went to high school?

Assessment:

Write a 3 – 5 page research report on the history of segregated schools in Flagstaff and the impact of national cases such as Mendez v. Westminster and Brown v. Board. Include at least three quotes from the oral history interviews in your paper that show differing points of view on segregation. Be sure to cite them in your bibliography.

Teacher Resources:

<http://www.landmarkcases.org/index.html>

http://www.civilrights.org/research_center/civilrights101/desegregation.html

<http://www.albany.edu/jmmh/vol3/chicano/chicano.html> (video - LA Mexican American school walkouts)

<http://www.civilrightsteaching.org/books.htm>

<http://www.prattcenter.net/cdc-cplc.php>

<http://www.teachersdomain.org/6-8/soc/ush/civil/mendez/index.html>

Donato, Ruben (1997). *The Other Struggle for Equal Schools: Mexican Americans during the Civil Rights Era*. State University of New York Press, 1997. LC2683 .D66 1997

Valencia, Richard R. (2005). The Mexican American Struggle for Equal Educational Opportunity in *Mendez v. Westminster*: Helping to Pave the Way for *Brown v. Board of Education*. *Teachers College Record* 107 (3), 389-423.

Wilson, Steven H., Brown over Other White: Mexican Americans' Legal Arguments and Litigation Strategy in School Desegregation Lawsuits. Law and History Review 21.1 (2003): 82 pars. 12 Jul. 2006

http://www.historycooperative.org/journals/lhr/21.1/forum_wilson.html.

This lesson plan correlates to the following Arizona state Social Studies standards:

8th grade
Strand 1
American History

Concept 1: Research Skills for History

- PO 1.** Construct charts, graphs, and narratives using historical data.
- PO 2.** Interpret historical data displayed in graphs, tables, and charts.
- PO 3.** Construct timelines (e.g., presidents/ world leaders, key events, people) of the historical era being studied.
- PO 4.** Formulate questions that can be answered by historical study and research.
- PO 5.** Describe the difference between a primary source document and a secondary source document and the relationships between them.
- PO 6.** Determine the credibility and bias of primary and secondary sources
- PO 7.** Analyze cause and effect relationships between and among individuals and/or historical events.
- PO 8.** Analyze two points of view on the same historical event

Strand 3

Concept 3: Functions of Government
Civics/Government

- PO 9.** Describe the impact that the following Acts had on increasing the rights of groups and individuals:
- Civil Rights Act of 1964
 - Voting Rights Act of 1965
 - Indian Rights Act of 1968

High School
Strand 3 Civic/Government

Concept 4: Rights, Responsibilities, and Roles of Citizenship

- PO 1.** Analyze basic individual rights and freedoms guaranteed by Amendments and laws:
- freedom of religion, speech, press, assembly, and petition in the First Amendment

- b. right to bear arms in the Second Amendment
- c. Ninth Amendment and guarantee of people's unspecified rights
- d. civil rights in the Thirteenth and Fourteenth Amendments
- e. voting rights in the Fifteenth, Nineteenth, Twenty-third, Twenty fourth, and Twenty-sixth Amendments; Native American citizenship and voting rights (Arizona, 1948); Voting Rights Act of 1965
- f. conflicts which occur between rights (e.g., the tensions between the right to a fair trial and freedom of the press, and between majority rule and individual rights)
- g. right to work laws

PO 2. Define citizenship according to the Fourteenth Amendment.

Strand 1 American History

Concept 1: Research Skills for History

PO 3. Formulate questions that can be answered by historical study and research.

PO 4. Construct graphs, tables, timelines, charts, and narratives to interpret historical data.

PO 5. Evaluate primary and secondary sources for:

- a. authors' main points
- b. purpose and perspective

Concept 7: Emergence of the Modern United States

PO 2. Assess how the following social developments influenced American society in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries:

- a. Civil Rights issues (e.g., Women's Suffrage Movement, Dawes Act, Indian schools, lynching, Plessy v. Ferguson)
- b. changing patterns in Immigration (e.g., Ellis Island, Angel Island, Chinese Exclusion Act, Immigration Act of 1924)
- c. urbanization and social reform (e.g., health care, housing, food & nutrition, child labor laws)